

Bernards School District Evaluation Committee

Recommendations for the Food Services RFP

1. List of Proposers:

- Aramark
- Chartwells

2. List of Evaluation Committee Members:

- Roderic McLaughlin

3. District’s Goal for the Food Service Program: For the purpose of this RFP, the District is seeking the most advantageous proposal, price and other factors included. The District will enter into a contract with the FSMC that best meets the District’s goals for the food service program. The District’s goals are to provide the best variety, nutrition and service while maintaining stated prices at a guaranteed minimum of \$300,000 surplus financial operation. Good variety, great taste, freshness, authenticity, healthy choices, ambiance, and excellent service will be the norm, not the exception. The FSMC must be innovative in providing appropriate food concepts that will attract and retain the students in a comforting and comfortable atmosphere.

4. Scoring Method:

- The proposals were evaluated by the following five criteria. Each criterion was given a weight based upon importance to the District. The evaluation committee scored each proposal assigning scores ranging from 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest score and 1 being the lowest. After the points were awarded by the evaluators, the weighing factor was applied and thus a total score was derived for each proposal.

The Criteria Used In Evaluating Proposals <i>The points awarded range from 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest score and 1 being the lowest</i>	Weighting Factor	Points
1. Financial return, FSMC guarantees and Fee: The amount of the guaranteed minimum of \$300,000 surplus including the amount and extent/limitation of the FSMCs financial guarantee. As well as the amount of the FSMC cents per meal fee.	25%	1 to 5
2. FSMCs capability, record of performance and financial condition: Corporate capability and experience will be measured by performance record, years in the industry, relevant experience, ability to successfully operate a non NSLP food service programs, number of districts served, client retention, references and the financial condition of the FSMC.	15%	1 to 5
3. Proposed onsite management: Considers the number of the management team proposed, references; proposal resumes, face to face interviews and any other method to discover the capabilities and skill level of the onsite manager.	30%	1 to 5
4. The Food Service program proposed by the FSMC: Considers how the FSMC will provide good variety, great taste, freshness, authenticity, healthy choices, ambiance, and excellent service that will be the norm, not the exception. Did the FSMC provide appropriate food concepts that will attract and retain the students in a comforting and comfortable atmosphere? Did the FSMC show how they used their creativity, skills, resources and staff to propose and provide a program that meets the District’s stated goal? How will the FSMC pricing strategy increase sales?	20%	1 to 5
5. FSMC’s Start Up/Transition Plan: Is the FSMC’s start up plan customized to the start of this program? Is the plan detailed plan from pre- planning (10 days prior to the start of the contract) through the start of the contract through the first three months to September 30, 2015? Did it detail the additional management/resources they will be providing as well as the startup task, any requirements for the District, implementation date, estimated completion date, and who is responsible (name and title)? Did the plan have enough different (not repetitive) tasks listed covering the startup activities in implementation, management, HR., food services and training? Was it submitted in Excel format or a Gantt chart?	10%	1 to 5

Bernards School District Evaluation Committee Recommendations for the Food Services RFP

5. Financial Comparison of Proposals:

FSMC MANAGEMENT FEE/PROFIT		
FSMC Fee Per Meal and Equivalent	\$0.2300	\$0.2000
Total Potential FSMC Fee	\$179,964.22	\$162,513.43
Percent of Revenue - Margin	7%	6%
SUMMARY		
EXPENSE TOTAL	\$2,186,180.22	\$2,322,099.43
REVENUE TOTAL	\$2,621,218.00	\$2,722,100.00
PROFIT/SURPLUS	\$435,037.78	\$400,000.57
Is the Surplus guaranteed?	Yes \$435,037	Yes \$400,000
Guarantee limited or unlimited?	Unlimited	Unlimited
Meals Prices Increased?	No	No
Total Investment by FSMC	\$100,000	\$135,000
Is Investment Charged to Program?	No	No
Summary of Answers		
Are there labor cuts?	No	No
Are there benefit cuts?	No	No
Are prices increased?	No	No
Are ala carte prices increased?	No	No
Returning rebates?	Yes	Yes
Summary of Service Days		
Elementary	171	171
Middle	182	182
High School	182	182
Projected Lunch Participation Rates & Average Daily Ala Carte Sales		
Elementary - Avg. daily ala carte daily by student	\$1.82	\$1.91
Middle School - Avg. daily ala carte daily by student	\$2.01	\$2.90
High School - Avg. daily ala carte daily by student	\$4.11	\$3.51

6. Program Offering Summary: The following provides a brief description of each of the proposers' proposed program offerings.

Number of Food Stations & Description Proposed by Each FSMC		
Name of Station	No.	Description
Aramark		
High School		
The Main	1	Entrée of the Day, Assorted Warm Breads (Biscuits, Cornbread, Garlic Bread) Hot Vegetables, Soup of the Day
Grab& Go Hot Slide	1	Rotating Grab/Go Hot Sandwiches, Rotating Chicken Wings, Angus Burgers, Angus Cheeseburgers, Chicken
Panini	1	Panini of the Day, Fries
Green Street Deli	1	Premium Cold Cuts, Assorted Breads, Wraps, Fries
Made to Order Salad Bar	1	Custom Made Salads with Premium Add-Ons
Action Station	1	Rotating Carving Station, Specialty Pasta Entree, Belgian Waffle, Baked Potato Bar, Top-Your-Own Beef Frank
Corner Crust	1	Cheese, Pepperoni and Specialty Pizza, Stromboli, Garlic Knots, Snacks and Beverages
Grab and Go Snacks	6	Freshly Baked Cookies, Fresh Baked Brownies and Muffins, Chips, Snacks, Homemade Rice Krispy Treats
Air Screens	6	Grab and Go Entrée Salads, Cold Sandwiches, side salads, Fruit Cups and Veggies with Dip, Pudding & Yogurt
Air Screen, Continued		Hummus Platters, Fresh Whole Fruit
Ice Cream	1	Assorted Ice Cream Novelties, Frozen Fruit Bars
Java City	1	Gourmet Coffee, Hot and Cold Coffee Beverages
Daily Breakfast Feature		"Diner Breakfast", Waffle Bar, Omelet Station, Cereal, Fruit, Baked Goods, Beverages
Number of points of payment		
Middle School		
Pizza	1	Cheese, Pepperoni and Specialty Pizza
Entrée	1	Entrée of the Day, Grab and Go Hot Sandwiches
Deli	1	Made to Order and Grab and Go Sandwiches, Fries, Hot and Cold Sides, Beverages and Snacks
Ice Cream	1	Assorted Ice Cream Novelties, Frozen Fruit Bars
Air Screens	3	Grab and Go Entrée Salads, Cold Sandwiches, side salads, Fruit Cups and Veggies with Dip, Yogurt Parfaits,
Number of points of payment		
Elementary		
Number of Daily Entrees		Brief Description
10		Entrée of the Day, Pizza, Hamburger, Cheeseburger, Chicken Sandwich, Veggie Burger, Bagel Bag, Yogurt, Entrée Salad.
Chartwells		
Name of Station	No.	Description
High School		
<i>Create</i>	1	Rotating concepts: comfort foods, pasta bar, display cooking with personal choice for entrée, international cuisines
<i>Grilled Express</i>	1	Grab and go boated hot sandwiches, burgers, sliders, chicken sandwiches
<i>So Deli</i>	1	Made-to-order sandwiches and wraps, daily special - toasted option
<i>2mato</i>	1	Personal size pizzas, flatbreads, calzones and Stromboli
<i>Wild Greens</i>	1	Made-to-order entrée salads
<i>ONtheGo</i>	1	Pre-made salads, wraps, sandwiches, a la carte snacks and beverages
<i>Extra!Extra!</i>	1	Fresh, local fruits and vegetables and side salads to accompany entrees
Number of points of payment	5	
Middle School		
<i>Pasta</i>	1	Assorted pasta and sauces
<i>Pizza</i>	1	Personal size pizzas, flatbreads, calzones and Stromboli
<i>Deli</i>	1	Made-to-order sandwiches and wraps, daily special
<i>International</i>	1	Rotating concept: Mexican, Asian, Mediterrean cuisine
<i>Grill</i>	1	Grab and go boated hot sandwiches, burgers, sliders, chicken sandwiches
<i>ONtheGO</i>	1	Pre-made salads, wraps, sandwiches, a la carte snacks and beverages
Number of points of payment	4	
Elementary		
Number of Daily Entrees		Brief Description
4		1 - 2 hot entrees, Alternate meals - sandwich or salad entrée meal

7. Summary of Finalist Scoring: The following evaluation scores resulted as scored by the evaluation committee after negotiations:

Bernards Evaluations of Award Criteria for Food Services					
Evaluator: Rod McLaughlin	Weighing Percent	Points Awarded (1 to 5)		Weighted Points	
CRITERIA		Aramark	Chartwells	Aramark	Chartwells
1. Financial return, FSMC guarantees and Fee.	25%	5.00	4.50	1.250	1.125
2. FSMCs capability, record of performance and financial condition.	15%	5.00	4.80	0.750	0.720
3. Proposed On-Site Management.	30%	4.85	4.60	1.455	1.380
4. The Food Service program proposed by the FSMC.	20%	4.50	4.50	0.900	0.900
5. FSMC's Start Up/Transition Plan.	10%	4.80	3.50	0.480	0.350
TOTALS	100%	24.15	21.90	4.835	4.475

- 1. Aramark: 4.835** – In terms of financial return, FSMC guarantees and fee, Aramark had the most advantageous mix of guaranteed return and fee. Based on their references and financial statements, they were deemed to be superior in terms of Service Capability, Record of Performance and Financial Condition. Aramark’s proposed management team was deemed to be the most impressive and earned them the highest score for Proposed On-Site Management. Both companies were judged to be equal in terms of the Service Program Proposed. Aramark’s Transition Plan was superior because they demonstrated that they had the systems, procedures and corporate support to achieve success through the life of the new contract.
- 2. Chartwells: 4.475** - In terms of financial return, FSMC guarantees and fee, Chartwells had a less desirable mix of guaranteed return and fee. Based on their references and financial statements, they were deemed to almost comparable to Aramark in Service Capability, Record of Performance and Financial Condition. Chartwells’ proposed management team was deemed to be slightly less impressive than Aramark’s Proposed On-Site Management. Both companies were judged to be equal in terms of the Service Program Proposed. Chartwells’ Transition Plan was impressive, however it was not up to par with the one provided by Aramark.

8. Recommendation of the Bernards School District Food Services RFP Evaluation Committee: Upon review of the proposals submitted, and based upon the RFP evaluation criteria, the committee concludes that the Aramark proposal is the most advantageous for Bernards School District.